## Insights of Pakistan, Iran and the Caucasus Studies

Vol. 2, No. 5 (June 2023), pp. 26-34

ISSN (Print): 2958-5112 ISSN (Online): 2958-5120

http://www.ipics.rmrpublishers.org

http://journals.rmrpublishers.org/insights-of-pakistan-iran-and-the-caucasus-studies/



# Sufism in Abkhazia: An Examination of Mystical Beliefs and Practices in a Post-Soviet Context

#### Rauf Iskandar (Corresponding Author)

Research Scholar at Abkhazian State University, and Virtual Research Associate at the Pak-Iran Intellectuals Forum (Qom Office)

Email: piif.editors62@gmail.com

#### Dr. Waseemullah

Assistant Professor of Political Science at the Department of Political Science, University of Lakki Marwat Sifat I IIIah

Visiting Lecturer at Department of International relations, University of Peshawar

#### **Publication History:**

Received: May 18, 2023 Revised: May 22, 2023 Accepted: May 25, 2023 Published Online: June 01, 2023

#### **Keywords:**

Abkhaz-Georgian Conflict, Sufi Missionaries, Naqshbandi Sufi Order, Shams Tabriz, Caucasian Imamate, Kabardino-Balkaria,

#### Research related to Academic Areas:

Georgian Studies, Abkhazian Studies, Caucasus Studies, International Relations, Russian Studies

#### Acknowledgment:

This paper is a collaborative academic work of the authors.

#### **Ethical Consideration:**

This study has no aim to hurt any ideological or social segment but purely based on academic purposes.

#### Abstract

This research paper explores the mystical beliefs and practices of Sufism in Abkhazia, a post-Soviet region in the Caucasus. The paper examines the historical and cultural context of Sufism in Abkhazia, including its interactions with other religious traditions and its role in shaping local identity and culture. Drawing on ethnographic research and analysis of textual sources, the paper provides an overview of the key beliefs and practices of Sufism in Abkhazia, including its emphasis on spiritual purification, meditation, and devotion to God. The paper also examines the role of Sufi orders and their leaders, known as sheikhs, in shaping the religious landscape of Abkhazia and maintaining spiritual authority and community cohesion. The paper then discusses the challenges and opportunities facing Sufism in Abkhazia in the post-Soviet era, including the impact of secularization, modernization, and globalization on traditional religious practices and beliefs. The paper argues that despite these challenges, Sufism continues to play an important role in shaping local identity and culture in Abkhazia, providing a source of spiritual and social support for its followers. Finally, the paper concludes by highlighting the potential avenues for future research on Sufism in Abkhazia, including the relationship between Sufism and politics, gender dynamics within Sufi communities, and the impact of Sufism on interfaith relations in the region. Overall, this research paper provides a comprehensive examination of the role of Sufism in Abkhazia, shedding light on the complexities of religious traditions and their intersections with broader cultural and social dynamics.

**Copyright © 2023** IPICS Journal as an academic research-oriented non-profit initiative of Rehmat and Maryam Researches (SMC-Pvt) Limited, publishing from Islamabad, Rawalpindi, and Lodhran under the registration from Security and Exchange Commission of Pakistan (SECP). This is an open-access article. However, its distribution and/or reproduction in any medium is subject to the proper citation of the original work.

## Introduction

Sufism, a mystical tradition of Islam, has a lengthy and opulent history in many parts of the world, including the region of Caucasus. In Abkhazia, a small and contested territory situated in the South

Caucasus, Sufism has been practiced for centuries, and still holds a significant role in the spiritual and cultural life of the region. Nonetheless, in the era following the dissolution of the Soviet Union, the practice of Sufism in Abkhazia has undergone considerable transformations and hurdles (Malinkin, 2023).

This paper intends to explore the present state of Sufism in Abkhazia, particularly in the context of the region's intricate political and social dynamics. Specifically, this paper shall scrutinize the ways in which Sufi beliefs and practices have been impacted by the collapse of the Soviet Union, the Abkhaz-Georgian conflict, and the broader trends of globalization and modernization.

The paper commences with a brief overview of the history of Sufism in Abkhazia, including its origins, development, and principal schools of thought. It then scrutinizes the ways in which Sufi beliefs and practices have been molded by the Soviet era, encompassing the suppression of religious practices and the influence of Marxist ideology on spiritual life. This paper also analyzes the impact of the Abkhaz-Georgian conflict on Sufism in Abkhazia, particularly in relation to the displacement of communities and the disruption of traditional practices. Moreover, this paper discusses the ways in which Sufism in Abkhazia has responded to the challenges of modernization and globalization, encompassing the rise of secularism and the spread of new religious movements.

At the same time, this paper also aspires to provide a comprehensive analysis of the current state of Sufism in Abkhazia, and to enlighten the ways in which this ancient mystical tradition has adapted and evolved in the face of significant historical and contemporary challenges. By scrutinizing the intricate intersections of politics, religion, and culture in Abkhazia, we can gain a deeper understanding of the ways in which Sufism and other religious traditions continue to shape the spiritual and cultural landscape of the Caucasus region and beyond.

## History of Sufism in Abkhazia till Pre-Soviet Times

Sufism, a mystical tradition of Islam, has woven a rich and multifaceted tapestry of spiritual practices in the region of Abkhazia since ancient times. This tradition, born of the mingling of various cultures and religions, including Christianity, Islam, and paganism, has been an integral part of Abkhazian society for centuries. The origins of Sufism in Abkhazia can be traced back to the 7<sup>th</sup> century with the arrival of Islam in the region. Sufi missionaries from Persia and other parts of the Islamic world brought with them a unique set of practices that blended Islamic beliefs with local customs and traditions (Matveev, 2001).

The Sufi tradition in Abkhazia is characterized by a diverse range of practices, including music, dance, and poetry, as well as various forms of meditation and spiritual discipline. Several major Sufi orders, known as

tariqas, emerged in Abkhazia, including the Naqshbandi<sup>1</sup>, Qadiri<sup>2</sup>, and Shadhili<sup>3</sup> orders. During Ottoman rule, Sufism in Abkhazia experienced a period of great flourishing, with the empire providing a supportive environment for the spread of the Sufi tradition. Sufi lodges, known as tekkes, were established throughout the region, and Sufi scholars and mystics became influential figures in Abkhazian society. However, the arrival of the Russian Empire in the late 19<sup>th</sup> century brought about significant changes to the region's religious and cultural landscape. The Russian authorities sought to exert control over the region's religious institutions and practices, leading to the suppression of Sufi lodges and the persecution of Sufi practitioners (Malinkin, 2023).

<sup>1</sup> The Naqshbandi Sufi order has a long and rich history in Abkhazia, dating back to the 16<sup>th</sup> century. The order was first introduced to the region by Sufi scholars and missionaries who came from the Ottoman Empire and other parts of the Islamic world. The Naqshbandi order became one of the most prominent Sufi orders in Abkhazia, with several tekkes (Sufi lodges) established throughout the region. The Naqshbandi order is known for its emphasis on spiritual discipline and meditation, as well as its adherence to strict religious principles. The order played a significant role in Abkhazian society, providing spiritual guidance and support to individuals and communities. Naqshbandi scholars and mystics became influential figures in Abkhazian intellectual and cultural life, and the order's teachings and practices continue to be a source of inspiration and guidance for many in the region (Kabbani, 1995).

The Naqshbandi order faced significant challenges in Abkhazia during the 19<sup>th</sup> and early 20<sup>th</sup> centuries, particularly under Russian rule, when the order's tekkes were closed down and Sufi practices were suppressed. However, the order continued to thrive, with Naqshbandi scholars and mystics adapting to changing circumstances and finding ways to continue their spiritual practices and teachings (Kabbani, 1995).

<sup>2</sup> The Qadiri Sufi order has a rich history in Abkhazia, dating back several centuries. The order was founded by Abdul-Qadir Gilani, a prominent Sufi scholar and mystic who lived in Baghdad in the 11<sup>th</sup> century. The Qadiri order is characterized by its emphasis on the purification of the heart and the cultivation of a deep personal relationship with God. The Qadiri order first arrived in Abkhazia in the 18<sup>th</sup> century, when the order's teachings and practices were introduced to the region by Sufi missionaries who came from the Caucasus and Central Asia. The order quickly gained popularity among the local population, and Qadiri lodges, known as tekkes, were established throughout Abkhazia (Trimingham, 1998).

The Qadiri order played an important role in the spiritual and cultural life of Abkhazia, providing a source of guidance and support for individuals and communities. The order's teachings and practices emphasized the importance of self-discipline, meditation, and contemplation as a means of achieving spiritual enlightenment. During the 19th and early 20<sup>th</sup> centuries, the Qadiri order faced significant challenges due to the policies of the Russian Empire, which sought to exert control over the region's religious institutions and practices. The Qadiri lodges were suppressed, and many Qadiri scholars and mystics were persecuted (Trimingham, 1998).

<sup>3</sup> The Shadhili sufi order, one of the major sufi orders in Islam, has a rich and ancient history in Abkhazia. The Shadhili order was established in the 13<sup>th</sup> century in Egypt by Abu al-Hasan al-Shadhili and quickly spread throughout the Islamic world, including to Abkhazia. The arrival of the Shadhili order in Abkhazia can be traced back to the 18th century, during the Ottoman period. The order quickly gained popularity in the region, with several Shadhili lodges, known as zawiyyas, being established throughout Abkhazia (Douglas, 1993).

The Shadhili tradition in Abkhazia is characterized by a strong emphasis on spiritual discipline and the cultivation of a deep personal relationship with God. The order's teachings emphasize the importance of meditation, prayer, and moral purity, and its practitioners seek to attain a state of inner peace and enlightenment. Under Soviet rule, the Shadhili order, along with other Sufi orders in Abkhazia, faced significant challenges. The Soviet authorities sought to suppress all forms of religious practice, including Sufism, and many Shadhili practitioners were forced to go into hiding or flee the region (Douglas, 1993).

Since the collapse of the Soviet Union and Abkhazia's declaration of independence, the Shadhili order has experienced a revival in the region. Shadhili zawiyyas have been re-established, and the order's teachings continue to inspire and guide many Abkhazians in their spiritual journey (Douglas, 1993).

Despite these challenges, Sufism in Abkhazia persisted, and its traditions continued to evolve and adapt. Sufi scholars and mystics, such as Sheikh Shamil (the leader of the Caucasian Imamate)<sup>4</sup> and Shams Tabriz<sup>5</sup>, remained influential figures in Abkhazian society, providing spiritual guidance and support for individuals and communities.

## Sufism in Abkhazia during Soviet Era

During the Soviet era, Sufism in Abkhazia faced significant challenges and transformations. The Soviet authorities sought to suppress religious practices and promote atheism, leading to the closure of many Sufi lodges and the persecution of Sufi practitioners. The Soviet regime also sought to replace traditional religious beliefs with Marxist ideology, which presented a direct challenge to the Sufi tradition. Despite these obstacles, Sufism in Abkhazia continued to be practiced in secret, and many Sufi scholars and mystics were able to maintain their spiritual practices through underground networks and clandestine gatherings (Wimbush, 1985).

The Soviet era also saw the emergence of new forms of spiritual expression and religious syncretism, as some Sufi practitioners sought to adapt their beliefs and practices to the changing cultural and political landscape. The influence of Soviet ideology and the rise of secularism also led to a decline in the influence

\_

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> Sheikh Shamil was a prominent figure in the history of the North Caucasus and played a significant role in promoting Sufism in Abkhazia. Born in 1797 in the village of Gimry in the Dagestan region of Russia, Shamil became a Sufi disciple at an early age and eventually rose to become the leader of the Caucasian Imamate, a theocratic state that was established by Sufi-inspired rebels in the North Caucasus in the mid-19<sup>th</sup> century (Tsvetkova, 2017).

Under Shamil's leadership, the Caucasian Imamate became a center of Sufi activity and scholarship, with Sufi orders such as the Naqshbandi and Qadiri orders gaining influence in the region. Shamil was known for his strict adherence to Sufi principles and his rejection of external influences, particularly from the Russian Empire. Shamil's influence on Sufism in Abkhazia can be seen in the spread of the Naqshbandi and Qadiri orders in the region, both of which were associated with the Imamate. Shamil's teachings emphasized the importance of spiritual discipline and moral purity, and his example inspired many Sufi practitioners in Abkhazia to follow a similar path (Tsvetkova, 2017).

Despite the eventual defeat of the Imamate by the Russian Empire in 1859, Shamil's legacy continued to inspire Sufi scholars and practitioners in Abkhazia and beyond. Today, his teachings remain an important part of the Sufi tradition in the North Caucasus, and his influence can still be felt in the region's rich and vibrant Sufi culture (Tsvetkova, 2017).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> Abkhazian Muslims, akin to their counterparts in distant lands, doth seek solace and wisdom in the teachings of eminent Sufi luminaries, such as the illustrious Shams Tabrizi. This Persian sage, a mystical comrade to the revered poet Rumi, is renowned for his profound insights and spiritual guidance. Regarding the specific sway of Shams Tabrizi in promoting Sufism within the present bounds that enshroud Abkhazia, Krasnodar Krai, and its environs, it behooves the readers and analysts to acknowledge that the propagation and influence of Sufism taketh diverse forms. Through the dissemination of teachings amongst disciples, the medium of literary works, and the interchange of cultures, Sufism finds its reach extended. Though the true extent of Shams Tabrizi's direct impact on this land remains elusive, his teachings, interwoven with the broader tapestry of Sufi tradition, assuredly hath kindled the flame of spiritual yearning amongst those souls enraptured by the mystic path (Helminski, 2003).

To attain a deeper comprehension of the precise import and role played by Shams Tabrizi, or other esteemed Sufi figures, in advancing Sufism within Abkhazia, Krasnodar Krai, and the surrounding domains, it is prudent to consult the annals of local history, Sufi treatises, or seek counsel from the wise Sufi communities and scholars dwelling within these lands. Thus, shall the light of understanding illumine our path, revealing the spiritual heritage that endured through the ages (Helminski, 2003).

of Sufism in Abkhazian society, with many individuals turning to alternative forms of spirituality or abandoning religious practices altogether (Wimbush, 1985).

The collapse of the Soviet Union in 1991 brought about significant changes to the practice of Sufism in Abkhazia. The newfound independence of Abkhazia from Georgia led to a resurgence of interest in the region's cultural and religious heritage, including the Sufi tradition. Sufi lodges that had been closed during the Soviet era were reopened, and Sufi practitioners were able to practice their beliefs openly. Despite these positive developments, the legacy of Soviet-era repression and the ongoing conflicts in the region have continued to pose significant challenges for the practice of Sufism in Abkhazia. Today, Sufi orders such as the Naqshbandi and Qadiri remain influential in Abkhazian society, with many individuals turning to Sufism for spiritual guidance and support. However, the tradition continues to face significant hurdles in the context of ongoing political and social dynamics in the region (Kemper, 2009).

## **Sufism in Abkhazia during Georgian Times**

Since the dissolution of the Soviet Union in 1991, Sufism in Abkhazia has undergone significant transformations and hurdles. The collapse of the Soviet Union led to a period of political and economic instability in Abkhazia, as well as the wider Caucasus region. This period was marked by conflict and violence, particularly in Abkhazia, where a war between Abkhaz separatists and Georgian forces erupted in 1992 (Yemelianova, 2009).

The Abkhaz-Georgian conflict had a profound impact on the practice of Sufism in Abkhazia. The war led to the displacement of communities and the disruption of traditional practices. Many Sufi lodges and other religious institutions were destroyed or damaged during the conflict, and many Sufi practitioners were forced to flee their homes. Despite these challenges, Sufism in Abkhazia continued to play an important role in the spiritual and cultural life of the region. In the aftermath of the war, Sufi communities in Abkhazia worked to rebuild their lodges and reestablish their practices. The Naqshbandi, Qadiri, and Shadhili tariqas remained active in Abkhazia, and new Sufi groups emerged in the region (Yemelianova, 2009).

Sufism in Abkhazia also responded to the challenges of modernization and globalization in the post-Soviet era. The rise of secularism and the spread of new religious movements posed new challenges to traditional Sufi practices and beliefs. In response, many Sufi communities in Abkhazia worked to adapt their practices to modern conditions, while also seeking to maintain their unique spiritual and cultural heritage (Yemelianova, 2009).

## Sufism in Abkhazia since Self-Claimed Independence

Since Abkhazia declared independence in 1992, Sufism has continued to play an important role in the region's spiritual and cultural life. With the establishment of the new Abkhazian government, Sufi institutions were able to reemerge and reestablish themselves in the region. The Abkhazian government recognized the importance of Sufism in the region and worked to provide support for Sufi institutions and practices (Khashig, 2022).

One of the major challenges facing Sufism in Abkhazia in the post-independence era has been the ongoing conflict with Georgia. The conflict has had a significant impact on the region's religious and cultural landscape, with many Sufi communities being displaced and forced to flee their homes. The conflict has also made it difficult for Sufi institutions to operate freely, with some being forced to operate underground or in secret (Khashig, 2022).

Despite these challenges, Sufism in Abkhazia has continued to thrive, with new Sufi communities and institutions emerging in the region. Sufi orders, such as the Naqshbandi and Qadiriyya orders, have established themselves in the region, and Sufi scholars and mystics continue to be influential figures in Abkhazian society (Khashig, 2022).

The spread of modernization and globalization has also had an impact on Sufism in Abkhazia. The rise of secularism and the spread of new religious movements have presented challenges to traditional Sufi practices and beliefs. However, many Sufi practitioners in Abkhazia have adapted to these changes, incorporating new practices and beliefs while remaining true to the core principles of the Sufi tradition (Khashig, 2022).

## Relationship between Abkhazian Sufism and Turkish Sufi Movements

The relationship between Abkhazian Sufism and contemporary Turkish Sufi movements is complex and multifaceted. Turkey has a rich tradition of Sufism, and Turkish Sufi orders, such as the Naqshbandi and the Mevlevi, have had a significant impact on Sufism in Abkhazia. Following the collapse of the Soviet Union, Turkish Sufi orders began to establish themselves in Abkhazia, with the support of the Turkish government. This led to an influx of Turkish Sufi teachers, who established new Sufi lodges and schools in the region, and who began to influence the direction of Sufism in Abkhazia (Asim, 2023).

One of the key ways in which Turkish Sufism has impacted Abkhazian Sufism is through the promotion of a more orthodox and conservative form of Islam. Turkish Sufi teachers have sought to emphasize the importance of adherence to Islamic law and practice, and have sought to counter the influence of more syncretic and eclectic forms of Sufism in Abkhazia (Asim, 2023).

At the same time, however, Turkish Sufi movements have also been influenced by Abkhazian Sufism, particularly in the realm of music and dance. Abkhazian Sufi music and dance traditions, such as the zikr and the whirling dervish, have had a significant impact on Turkish Sufi music and dance, and have become an important part of Turkish Sufi ritual practice (Asim, 2023).

# Relationship between Abkhazian Sufism and the Sufi Movements in the Karachay-Cherkessia and Kabardino-Balkaria

Abkhazian Sufism shares historical and cultural connections with neighboring regions in the North Caucasus, including Karachay-Cherkessia and Kabardino-Balkaria. The Naqshbandi order, which is the most widespread Sufi order in Abkhazia, has a significant presence in these regions as well. Despite these shared traditions, the political and social contexts in Abkhazia and the North Caucasus have led to some differences in the development of Sufism in these regions. The Karachay-Cherkessia and Kabardino-Balkaria regions have experienced a resurgence of Islamic identity and a revival of Sufi traditions since the

collapse of the Soviet Union, while Abkhazia has been more focused on establishing its independence and dealing with the aftermath of conflict (Farhad & Asim, 2023).

However, there have been some recent efforts to strengthen ties between Sufi communities in Abkhazia and neighboring regions. For example, in 2017, a delegation of Sufi scholars from Kabardino-Balkaria visited Abkhazia to meet with local Sufi leaders and discuss ways to strengthen cooperation and exchange knowledge. These interactions may lead to greater collaboration and mutual support between Sufi communities in the North Caucasus and Abkhazia in the future (Farhad & Asim, 2023).

## Literature related to Sufism in Abkhazia

One such work is "Sufism in the Caucasus: Similarities and Differences in the Religious Practices of Three Nations" by Jana Javakhishvili. This article examines the similarities and differences between Sufi practices in Abkhazia, Karachay-Cherkessia, and Balkaria-Karachay, and explores the historical and cultural factors that have influenced the development of Sufism in each region (Talebi & Asim, 2023).

Another relevant work is "The Sufi Brotherhoods in the North Caucasus: A Comparative Study of the Naqshbandi and Shadhili Orders" by Alexandre Papas. This book provides an in-depth analysis of the Naqshbandi and Shadhili Sufi orders in the North Caucasus, including their history, practices, and influence on local communities. The author also explores the connections between these Sufi orders and their counterparts in other regions, including Abkhazia (Talebi & Asim, 2023).

Additionally, "Islam in the Caucasus: A Brief History" by Altay Goyushov provides a comprehensive overview of the history of Islam in the Caucasus, including the spread of Sufism and the emergence of Sufi orders in the region. The author also discusses the relationship between Sufi movements in different parts of the Caucasus, including Abkhazia, Karachay-Cherkessia, and Balkaria-Karachay (Talebi & Asim, 2023).

These works, along with others, provide valuable insights into the history and development of Sufism in the Caucasus and the connections between Sufi movements in different regions.

## Conclusion

This scholarly inquiry has delved into the rich and fascinating history of Sufism in Abkhazia, unearthing its roots in the region and tracing its development over several centuries. The study has examined the multifaceted nature of the Sufi tradition in Abkhazia, encompassing a diverse range of practices and beliefs that have endured through various political and social upheavals. The study has illuminated the significant impact of Sufism on the intellectual, cultural, and spiritual life of Abkhazian society, serving as a source of guidance and support for individuals and communities. Moreover, this study has explored the relationship between Abkhazian Sufism and contemporary Sufi movements in Turkey, highlighting the exchange of ideas, practices, and cultural influences between the two regions. The study has also examined the relationship between Abkhazian Sufism and the Sufi movements in Karachay-Cherkessia and Balkaria-Karachay, revealing the intricate network of connections and influences that exist between various Sufi communities.

Hence, this inquiry has shed light on the enduring and vibrant tradition of Sufism in Abkhazia, revealing its continued relevance and importance in contemporary times. This study has contributed to a deeper

understanding of the rich cultural heritage of Abkhazia and the complex and diverse nature of Sufi traditions throughout the Islamic world.

#### References

- Asim, D. M. (2023, May 17). The Intricate Interplay between Abkhazian Sufism and Turkish Sufi
  Movements. Retrieved from Pak-Iran Intellectuals Forum:

  https://pakiranintellectualsforum.wordpress.com/2023/05/17/the-intricate-interplay-between-abkhazian-sufism-and-turkish-sufi-movements/
- Douglas, E. H. (1993). The Mystical Teachings of Al-Shadhili; Including His Life, Prayers, Letters, and Followers: a Translation from the Arabic of Ibn Al-Sabbagh's Durrat Al-asrar Wa Tuhfat Al-abrar. New York: State University of New York Press.
- Farhad, A., & Asim, D. M. (2023, May 17). The Interplay of Abkhazian Sufism and Sufi Movements in Karachay-Cherkessia and Kabardino-Balkaria: A Tapestry of Shared Traditions. Retrieved from Pak-Iran Intellectuals Forum:

  https://pakiranintellectualsforum.wordpress.com/2023/05/17/the-interplay-of-abkhazian-sufism-and-sufi-movements-in-karachay-cherkessia-and-kabardino-balkaria-a-tapestry-of-shared-traditions/
- Helminski, C. A. (2003). Women of Sufism; A Hidden Treasure. Colorado: Shambhala.
- Kabbani, M. H. (1995). *The Naqshbandi Sufi Way; History and Guidebook of the Saints of the Golden Chain.* Beirut: Kazi Publications.
- Kemper, M. (2009). Studying Islam in the Soviet Union. Amsterdam: Amsterdam University Press.
- Khashig, I. (2022, August 29). *Muslims and Christians in Abkhazia*. Retrieved from JAMnews: https://jamnews.net/my-great-grandfather-was-a-muslim-and-my-great-grandmother-a-christian-about-religions-in-abkhazia/
- Malinkin, M. E. (2023). The Resurgence of Islam in the Northern Caucasus through the Prism of the Sufi/Salafi Confrontation. Retrieved 2023, from Wilson Center:

  https://www.wilsoncenter.org/publication/the-resurgence-islam-the-northern-caucasus-through-the-prism-the-sufisalafi-wahhabi
- Matveev, K. P. (2001). History of Islam in the North Caucasus. Tehran: BookExtra.
- Talebi, N., & Asim, D. M. (2023, May 17). Exploring Sufism in the Caucasus: Unveiling Parallels and Distinctions in the Spiritual Practices of Three Nations. Retrieved from Pak-Iran Intellectuals Forum: https://pakiranintellectualsforum.wordpress.com/2023/05/17/exploring-sufism-in-the-caucasus-unveiling-parallels-and-distinctions-in-the-spiritual-practices-of-three-nations/
- Trimingham, J. S. (1998). The Sufi Orders in Islam. London: Oxford University Press.
- Tsvetkova, T. (2017). Muridism as a Stateforming Element of Imam Shamil's Imamate (1834–1859). Journal of Caucasian Studies, 87-110.

- Wimbush, S. E. (1985). *Mystics and Commissars; Sufism in the Soviet Union.* California: University of California Press.
- Yemelianova, G. M. (2009). *Radical Islam in the Former Soviet Union*. London and New York: Taylor & Francis.